# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Civil Action No. 23-CV-6524-FPG

STEVEN G. JAMES, in his official capacity as Superintendent of the New York State Police,

Defendant.

**DESIGNATION OF RECORD ON APPEAL** 

Attached hereto as Exhibit A is the Designation of Record on Appeal.

Dated: May 22, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Stephen Klein

Stephen R. Klein (pro hac vice) BARR & KLEIN PLLC 1629 K St. N.W. Ste. 300 Washington, DC 20006 (202) 804-6676 steve@barrklein.com

Benjamin Barr (pro hac vice) BARR & KLEIN PLLC 444 N. Michigan Avenue, Ste. 1200 Chicago, IL 60611 (202) 595-4671 ben@barrklein.com Ginger D. Schröder Linda H. Joseph Schröder, Joseph & Associates, LLP 394 Franklin Street, Second Floor Buffalo, New York 14202 (716) 863-4000 gschroder@sjalegal.com ljoseph@sjalegal.com

Attorneys for George Borrello, David DiPietro, William Ortman, Aaron Dorr and the New York State Firearms Association.

# EXHIBIT A

# U.S. DISTRICT COURT U.S. District Court, Western District of New York (Rochester) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 6:23-cv-06524-FPG

New York State Firearms Association et al v. Chiumento

Assigned to: Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr.

Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 09/13/2023 Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 950 Constitutional - State

Statute

Jurisdiction: Federal Question

#### **Plaintiff**

**New York State Firearms Association** 

# represented by Benjamin T. Barr

Barr & Klein PLLC 444 N. Michigan Avenue Suite 1200 Chicago, IL 60611 202-595-4671 LEAD ATTORNEY PRO HAC VICE ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Ginger D. Schroder

Schroder, Joseph & Associates, LLP 394 Franklin Street 2nd Floor
Buffalo, NY 14202
(716) 863-4000
Fax: 716-881-4909
Email: gschroder@sjalegal.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Linda H. Joseph

Schroder, Joseph & Associates, LLP 394 Franklin Street 2nd Floor Buffalo, NY 14202 716-881-4900 Fax: 716-881-4902 Email: ljoseph@sjalegal.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Stephen R. Klein

Barr & Klein PLLC 1629 K Street NW

Washington, DC 20006 202-804-6676 Email: steve@barrklein.com LEAD ATTORNEY PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

# George Borrello

# represented by Benjamin T. Barr

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Ginger D. Schroder

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Linda H. Joseph

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Stephen R. Klein

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **Plaintiff**

#### **David DiPietro**

# represented by Benjamin T. Barr

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Ginger D. Schroder

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Linda H. Joseph

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Stephen R. Klein

(See above for address)

Filed 05/22/24 Page 5 of 12

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

#### **William Ortman**

# represented by Benjamin T. Barr

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Ginger D. Schroder

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Linda H. Joseph

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Stephen R. Klein

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

#### **Aaron Dorr**

#### represented by Benjamin T. Barr

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Ginger D. Schroder

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Linda H. Joseph

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Stephen R. Klein

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

#### **Defendant**

# Dominick L. Chiumento

in his official capacity as Acting Superintendent of the New York State Police

# represented by Heather Lynn McKay

New York State Attorney General's Office Department of Law 144 Exchange Boulevard Rochester, NY 14614 585-327-3207 Fax: 585-546-7514

Email: heather.mckay@ag.ny.gov *LEAD ATTORNEY* 

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# James M. Thompson

Office of the New York Attorney General NYC
28 Liberty Street
14th Floor
New York, NY 10005
212-416-6556
Email: james.thompson@ag.ny.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Matthew D. Brown

New York State Office of the Attorney General 144 Exchange Boulevard Suite 200 Rochester, NY 14614 585-546-7430

Fax: 585-546-7514

Email: matthew.brown@ag.ny.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
09/13/2023	1	COMPLAINT against Steven A. Nigrelli \$ 402 receipt number ANYWDC-4974753, filed by William Ortman, New York State Firearms Association, David DiPietro, George Borrello. (Attachments: # 1 Civil Cover Sheet, # 2 Summons)(Schroder, Ginger) (Entered: 09/13/2023)
09/13/2023		Case Assigned to Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr. Notification to Chambers of on-line civil case opening. (TMK) (Entered: 09/13/2023)
09/13/2023		AUTOMATIC REFERRAL to Mediation The ADR Plan is available for download at <a href="http://www.nywd.uscourts.gov/alternative-dispute-resolution">http://www.nywd.uscourts.gov/alternative-dispute-resolution</a> .(TMK) (Entered: 09/13/2023)

09/13/2023	Case	Notice of Availability of Magistrate Judge: A United States Magistrate of this Court is available to conduct all proceedings in this civil action in accordance with 28 U.S.C. 636c and FRCP 73. The Notice, Consent, and Reference of a Civil Action to a Magistrate Judge form (AO-85) is available for download at <a href="http://www.uscourts.gov/services-forms/forms">http://www.uscourts.gov/services-forms/forms</a> . (TMK) (Entered: 09/13/2023)	
09/13/2023	2	Summons Issued as to Steven A. Nigrelli. (TMK) (Entered: 09/13/2023)	
09/15/2023	3	Letter filed by George Borrello, David DiPietro, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman as to Steven A. Nigrelli <i>to Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr.</i> . (Joseph, Linda) (Entered: 09/15/2023)	
09/15/2023	4	AMENDED COMPLAINT against All Defendants, filed by William Ortman, New York State Firearms Association, David DiPietro, George Borrello, Aaron Dorr. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - Dorr Declaration) (Joseph, Linda) Modified on 9/18/2023 (JHF). (Entered: 09/15/2023)	
09/15/2023	<u>5</u>	MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction by George Borrello, David DiPietro, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman, Aaron Dorr. (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support, # 2 Supplement TRO Witness and Exhibit List, # 3 Supplement Amended Complaint, # 4 Supplement Exhibit A to Amended Complaint, # 5 Text of Proposed TRO Order, # 6 Text of Proposed PI Order) (Joseph, Linda) Modified on 9/18/2023 (JHF). (Entered: 09/15/2023)	
09/15/2023	<u>6</u>	MOTION to Expedite by George Borrello, David DiPietro, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman, Aaron Dorr. (Attachments: # 1 Supplement Notice of Motion, # 2 Supplement Memorandum of Law, # 3 Supplement TRO Witness and Exhibit List, # 4 Supplement Amended Complaint, # 5 Supplement Exhibit A - Dorr Declaration to Amended Complaint, # 6 Supplement TRO Proposed Order, # 7 Supplement PI Proposed Order, # 8 Text of Proposed Order for Expedited Hearing) (Joseph, Linda) Modified on 9/18/2023 (JHF). (Entered: 09/15/2023)	
09/15/2023	7	MOTION to appear pro hac vice (Filing fee \$ 200 receipt number ANYWDC-4977309.) by George Borrello, David DiPietro, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman, Aaron Dorr. (Attachments: # 1 Supplement Sponsoring Affidavit, # 2 Supplement Petition, # 3 Supplement Attorney's Oath, # 4 Supplement Appendix to Civility Principles Oath of Office, # 5 Supplement Attorney Database and E-Filing Registration Form, # 6 Supplement Motion to Admit Stephen Klein) (Joseph, Linda) Modified on 9/18/2023 (JHF). (Entered: 09/15/2023)	
09/18/2023		E-Filing Notification: Clerk revised the docket text of 4, 5, 6 and 7 and added new plaintiff "Aaron Dorr" to the text and to the docket. (JHF) (Entered: 09/18/2023)	
09/20/2023	8	Corporate Disclosure Statement by New York State Firearms Association. (Schroder, Ginger) Modified on 9/20/2023 (JHF). (Entered: 09/20/2023)	
09/20/2023		E-Filing Notification: Clerk revised the docket text of <u>8</u> Corporate Disclosure Statement to show that only New York State Firearms Association was the filer of the document and not the other plaintiffs as well. (JHF) (Entered: 09/20/2023)	
09/21/2023	9	DECISION AND ORDER: For the reasons stated in the Order, Plaintiffs' <u>5</u> Motion for a Temporary Restraining Order is DENIED. The Court orders the briefing schedule on the preliminary injunction motion against Defendant as follows: By 5:00 P.M. on September 22, 2023, Plaintiffs shall serve a copy of this Decision & Order on	

	Case	Defendant and file an affidavit of service confirming such. By 5:00 P.M. on October 13, 2023, Defendant shall file its response to Plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction. By 5:00 P.M. on October 27, 2023, Plaintiffs may file a reply. The Court reserves the right to schedule oral argument should it determine the need exists. SO ORDERED. Signed by Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr. on 9/21/2023. (AJW) (Entered: 09/21/2023)	
09/22/2023	10	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Decision and Order dated 9/21/2023 served on Attorney General's Office and Steven Nigrelli on 9/22/2023, filed by George Borrello, David DiPietro, Aaron Dorr, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - Hand Delivery Confirmation, # 2 Exhibit B - Certified Mail Receipt)(Schroder, Ginger) (Entered: 09/22/2023)	
09/22/2023	11	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by George Borrello, David DiPietro, Aaron Dorr, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman re 9 Order on Motion to Expedite. Schroder, Ginger) (Entered: 09/22/2023)	
09/27/2023	12	MOTION to appear pro hac vice <i>of Benjamin Barr</i> (Filing fee \$ 200 receipt number ANYWDC-4985641.) by George Borrello, David DiPietro, Aaron Dorr, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman. (Attachments: # 1 Motion to Admit Benjamin Barr Pro Hac Vice, # 2 Text of Proposed Order, # 3 Petition for Admission Pro Hac Vice, # 4 Affidavit of Sponsor Ginger D. Schroder, # 5 Attorney's Oath, # 6 Oath of Office, # 7 Attorney Database & Electronic Case Filing Registration Form, # 8 Certificate of Service)(Schroder, Ginger) (Entered: 09/27/2023)	
10/06/2023	13	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Summons, Complaint, Civil Cover Sheet, Amended Complaint with Exhibit A, Motion for Temporary Restraining Order and supporting papers, Motion to Expedite and supporting papers, Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice and supporting papers, served on Attorney General's Office on 9/26/2023, filed by George Borrello, David DiPietro, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman. (Joseph, Linda) (Entered: 10/06/2023)	
10/11/2023	14	NOTICE of Appearance by James M. Thompson on behalf of Steven A. Nigrelli (Thompson, James) (Entered: 10/11/2023)	
10/11/2023	<u>15</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages in upcoming Preliminary Injunction opposition brief by Steven A. Nigrelli.(Thompson, James) (Entered: 10/11/2023)	
10/12/2023	16	TEXT ORDER granting 15 Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. Defendant may file up to but not exceeding 35 pages in its memorandum in opposition to Plaintiffs' 5 motion for a preliminary injunction. Plaintiffs may file up to but not exceeding 20 pages in reply. SO ORDERED. Signed by Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr. on 10/12/2023. (AJW) (Entered: 10/12/2023)	
10/13/2023	<u>17</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Matthew D. Brown on behalf of Steven A. Nigrelli (Brown Matthew) (Entered: 10/13/2023)	
10/13/2023	18	NOTICE of Appearance by Heather Lynn McKay on behalf of Steven A. Nigrelli (McKay, Heather) (Entered: 10/13/2023)	
10/13/2023	19	RESPONSE in Opposition re 5 MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction filed by Steven A. Nigrelli. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of Dominick L. Chiumento, # 2 Declaration of Michael W. Deyo, # 3 Declaration of James M. Thompson, # 4 Exhibit 1 - 1755 Johnson Dictionary Definition of "Infringe", # 5 Exhibit 2 - 1775 Ash Dictionary Definition of "Infringe", # 6 Exhibit 3 - 1755 Johnson	

	Case	Dictionary Definition of "Abridge", #Z Exhibit 4 - 1806 Webster Dictionary Definition of "Abridge", # & Exhibit 5 - 1806 Webster Dictionary Definition of "Abridge", # & Exhibit 5 - 1806 Webster Dictionary Definition of "Infringe", # & Exhibit 6 - 1755 Johnson Dictionary Definition of "License", # 10 Exhibit 7 - 1664 New York Law Against Trading Gunpowder and Ammunition, # 11 Exhibit 8 - 1664 Pennsylvania Law Against Trading Gunpowder and Ammunition, # 11 Exhibit 10 - 1633 Massachusetts Law Against Trading Gunpowder and Ammunition, # 12 Exhibit 10 - 1633 Massachusetts Law Against Trading Gunpowder and Ammunition, # 14 Exhibit 11 - 1744 Letter from New York Governor About Forbidding Ammunition Exports, # 15 Exhibit 12 - 1637 Massachusetts Law Disarming Protestant Dissidents of Ammunition, # 16 Exhibit 13 - 1677 Rhode Island Law Disarming Native Americans of Ammunition, # 17 Exhibit 14 - 1756 Virginia Law Disarming Roman Catholics of Gunpowder and Ammunition, # 18 Exhibit 15 - 1776 Massachusetts Law Disarming Persons Disaffected to America of Ammunition, # 19 Exhibit 16 - 1777 New Jersey Law Disarming Persons Disaffected to America of Ammunition, # 19 Exhibit 16 - 1777 New Jersey Law Disarming Persons Disaffected to America of Ammunition, # 20 Exhibit 17 - 1788 Pennsylvania Law Disarming Persons Disaffected to America of Ammunition, # 21 Exhibit 18 - 1680 Virginia Law Imposing Tax in Gunpowder, # 22 Exhibit 19 - 1789 Rhode Island Law Taxing Gunpowder Imports, # 23 Exhibit 20 - 1838 Florida Law Requiring Licenses and Taxes to Sell Guns, # 24 Exhibit 21 - 1844 Mississippi Law Taxing Pistols, # 25 Exhibit 23 - 1866 North Carolina Law Taxing Pistols, # 25 Exhibit 25 - 1883 Ohio Law Imposing Fees on Gunpowder Vendors, # 29 Exhibit 26 - 1883 Tennessee Law Banning Sales of Pistol Cartridges, # 30 Exhibit 27 - 1884 Alabama Law Imposing Fee on Dealers in Pistol Cartridges, # 31 Exhibit 28 - 1887 Law Increasing License Fee on Dealers in Pistol Cartridges, # 32 Exhibit 29 - 1890 South Carolina Law Imposing Regulatory Fee for
10/13/2023	<u>20</u>	MOTION to Substitute Party <i>in light of Superintendent Nigrelli's retirement</i> by Steven A. Nigrelli.(Thompson, James) (Entered: 10/13/2023)
10/18/2023	21	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Summons, Complaint and Amended Complaint served on Steven Nigrelli on 9/21/2023, filed by George Borrello, David DiPietro, Aaron Dorr, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - Signed Return Receipt, # 2 Exhibit B - USPS Online Tracking)(Schroder, Ginger) (Entered: 10/18/2023)
10/23/2023	22	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer and Correction Regarding Service by Steven A. Nigrelli.(Thompson, James) (Entered: 10/23/2023)
10/24/2023	23	TEXT ORDER: The Court acknowledges the Parties' 20 MOTION to substitute party. Because Superintendent Nigrelli has resigned, Superintendent Dominick L. Chiumento

	Case	6:23-cv-06524-FPG . Document 31. Filed 05/22/24 Page 10 of 12 is automatically substituted as the defendant in this action pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 25(d). The Clerk of Court is hereby directed to update in the case caption to reflect the name of the substituted party. The Court also acknowledges the Parties' 22 Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer. Defendant's deadline to answer or otherwise respond to the Complaint is extended until 30 days after the resolution of the 5 preliminary injunction motion currently pending, including any applicable appeals or petitions for certiorari. SO ORDERED. Signed by Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr. on 10/24/2023. (AJW)	
		Clerk to Follow up (Entered: 10/24/2023)	
10/25/2023		E-Filing Notification: Clerk updated case caption and substituted Dominick L. Chiumento for defendant Steven A. Nigrelli per 23 Text Order. (JHF) (Entered: 10/25/2023)	
10/27/2023	24	REPLY/RESPONSE to re 5 MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction Plaintiffs' Reply Brief in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction filed by George Borrello, David DiPietro, Aaron Dorr, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of G. Schroder, # 2 Exhibit 1 - Declaration of Vern Dorgan, # 3 Exhibit 2 - Declaration of Francis Rice, # 4 Exhibit 3 - Declaration of Frank Yuroshoski, # 5 Exhibit 4 - Declaration of Harry Clauss, # 6 Exhibit 5 - Declaration of Kimberly Crast, # 7 Exhibit 6 - Declaration of Ed Jacobs, # 8 Exhibit 7 - Declaration of Darrell Eckhard, # 9 Exhibit 8 - Declaration of David Porrata, # 10 Exhibit 9 - Declaration of John Ryan, # 11 Exhibit 10 - Declaration of Rob Ralyea) (Schroder, Ginger) (Entered: 10/27/2023)	
10/30/2023	<u>25</u>	MOTION to Strike <i>Declarations Improperly Filed on Reply</i> by Dominick L. Chiumento.(Thompson, James) (Entered: 10/30/2023)	
10/31/2023	<u>26</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>25</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Declarations Improperly Filed on Reply</i> filed by George Borrello, David DiPietro, Aaron Dorr, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman. (Schroder, Ginger) (Entered: 10/31/2023)	
12/11/2023	27	Letter filed by Dominick L. Chiumento as to Dominick L. Chiumento <i>Regarding Recent Significant Second Circuit Decisions in Firearms Cases</i> . (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - Second Circuit Decision in Antonyuk v. Chiumento, # 2 Exhibit 2 - Second Circuit Decision in Gazzola v. Hochul)(Thompson, James) (Entered: 12/11/2023)	
05/02/2024	28	TEXT ORDER granting 7 Motion for Pro Hac Vice; granting 12 Motion for Pro Hac Vice. SO ORDERED. Signed by Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr. on 5/2/2024. (AJW)	
		Clerk to Follow up (Entered: 05/02/2024)	
05/02/2024	<u>29</u>	DECISION AND ORDER: For the reasons stated in the Order, Plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction, ECF No. 5, is DENIED. The Superintendent's motion to Strike Declarations Improperly Filed, ECF No. 25, is DENIED. All claims asserted by NYSFA are DISMISSED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. SO ORDERED. Signed by Hon. Frank P. Geraci, Jr. on 5/2/2024. (AJW) (Entered: 05/02/2024)	
05/13/2024	30	NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL as to 29 Decision and Order by George Borrello, David DiPietro, Aaron Dorr, New York State Firearms Association, William Ortman (Filing fee \$605, receipt number ANYWDC-5179260). (Klein, Stephen) Modified on 5/14/2024 (JHF). (Entered: 05/13/2024)	

05/14/2024	Case 6:23-cv-06524-FPG Document 31 Filed 05/22/24 Page 11 of 12 E-Filing Notification: Clerk revised docket text to 30 to "NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL" to clarify the filing event. (JHF) (Entered: 05/14/2024)
05/14/2024	Within 14 days of filing 30 Notice of Interlocutory Appeal, the appellant is required to electronically file with the District Court an index of filed documents it wishes the Court of Appeals to consider, called Designation of Record on Appeal. After receipt, the Clerk's Office will certify and transmit the index to the Circuit.
	Pursuant to Local Rule 12.1 of the US Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, Forms C and D must be completed within 14 days after the filing of a notice of appeal. Forms C and D can be obtained at: <www.ca2.uscourts.gov>. (JHF) (Entered: 05/14/2024)</www.ca2.uscourts.gov>

PACER Service Center					
Transaction Receipt					
05/22/2024 09:28:18					
PACER Login: kleinpacer Client Code:					
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	6:23-cv-06524-FPG		
Billable Pages:	8	Cost:	0.80		

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on May 22, 2024, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system and that copies were sent by email and to all counsel of record.

/s/ Stephen Klein
Stephen R. Klein